### The role of Implementation in Program Evaluation in PreK-12 Schools

Bianca Montrosse-Moorhead Assistant Professor Measurement, Evaluation, & Assessment Educational Psychology Department

### **Learning Objectives**



#### Why Implementation Matters



1	Change comes from action, not outcomes.
2	Implementation is about describing what we are doing (actions) to promote change.
3	What works, for whom, and under what conditions requires examining implementation and outcomes.
4	It's hard to sustain and scale something up if you do not fully understand how it works.
5	Funders are increasingly interested in implementation (e.g., Goal 3 IES studies require an implementation study).



























PROCESS EVALUATION Example process evaluation questions: How well designed is the program? **How well implemented is the program?** How appropriate are the processes compared with quality standards? With cultural norms? How good are program outputs? What has been done in an innovative way?

### Implementation Fidelity Defined





A systematic inquiry to determine the "extent to which an innovation is enacted according to its intended model."

Century & Cassata, 2016, p. 171

1. Engage stakeholders.

- 1. Engage stakeholders.
  - 2. Describe the program.

- 1. Engage stakeholders.
  - 2. Describe the program.
  - 3. Identify and specify fidelity criteria.

- 1. Engage stakeholders.
  - 2. Describe the program.
  - 3. Identify and specify fidelity criteria.
  - 4. Set fidelity benchmarks.

- 1. Engage stakeholders.
  - 2. Describe the program.
  - 3. Identify and specify fidelity criteria.
  - 4. Set fidelity benchmarks.
  - 5. Gather fidelity data (usual research methods rules apply, e.g., validity and reliability).

- 1. Engage stakeholders.
  - 2. Describe the program.
  - 3. Identify and specify fidelity criteria.
  - 4. Set fidelity benchmarks.
  - **5. Gather fidelity data** (usual research methods rules apply, e.g., validity and reliability).
  - 6. Integrate results into a final judgment about program fidelity.

- 1. Engage stakeholders.
  - 2. Describe the program.
  - 3. Identify and specify fidelity criteria.
  - 4. Set fidelity benchmarks.
  - **5. Gather fidelity data** (usual research methods rules apply, e.g., validity and reliability).
  - 6. Integrate results into a final judgment about program fidelity.
  - 7. Use & share lessons learned.

. . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . . .

- 1. Engage stakeholders.
  - 2. Describe the program.
  - 3. Identify and specify fidelity criteria.
  - 4. Set fidelity benchmarks.
  - **5. Gather fidelity data** (usual research methods rules apply, e.g., validity and reliability).
  - 6. Integrate results into a final judgment about program fidelity.
  - 7. Use & share lessons learned.

- 1. Engage stakeholders.
  - 2. Describe the program.
  - 3. Identify and specify fidelity criteria.
  - 4. Set fidelity benchmarks.
  - **5. Gather fidelity data** (usual research methods rules apply, e.g., validity and reliability).
  - 6. Integrate results into a final judgment about program fidelity.
  - 7. Use & share lessons learned.

#### **Standard S** Feasibility Utility Propriety Accuracy



.....

- 1. Engage stakeholders.
- 2. Describe the program.
- 3. Identify and specify fidelity criteria.
- 4. Set fidelity benchmarks.
- 5. Gather fidelity data (usual research methods rules apply, e.g., validity and reliability).
- 6. Integrate results into a final judgment about program fidelity.
- 7. Use & share lessons learned.

**Standard S** Feasibility Utility Propriety Accuracy





#### **Decisions to be Made**

1. Identify and operationally define the program's core components?

- 2. Fidelity criteria, including operational definitions?
- 3. Fidelity benchmarks?
- 4. Research methods to measure each core component?
- 5. Appropriate time frame for data collection?
- 6. Reliability and validity of measures?

7. How the data will be summarized and/or reduced for analysis?



#### **Decisions to be Made**

1. Identify and operationally define the program's core components?

2. Fidelity criteria, including operational definitions?

- 3. Fidelity benchmarks?
- 4. Research methods to measure each core component?
- 5. Appropriate time frame for data collection?
- 6. Reliability and validity of measures?

7. How the data will be summarized and/or reduced for analysis?

#### Dane & Schneider (1998) Criteria Model



"The **most widely cited criteria** for fidelity measurement are attributed to **Dane and Schneider** (1998)" (Century & Cassata, 2016,

Adherence	Measure of extent to which program is being delivered as designed.
Exposure	Index measure of exposure (e.g., # of sessions implemented, length of each session, frequency).
Delivery Quality	Measure of aspects of delivery that are not directly related to the prescribed implementation (e.g., implementer enthusiasm).
	,
Participant Response	Measure of participant response to program sessions.
Program Differentiation	Measure of to ensure that the critical features that distinguish the program from the comparison are present.

# Are citations synonymous

- Systematic review of **published** implementation studies (2013-2015)
- n=111 studies

# Are citations synonymous

- Systematic review of published implementation studies (2013-2015)
- n=111 studies



Based on Montrosse-Moorhead, Juskiewicz, Li, Rhoads, & Gambino (2016)

## Are citations synonymous

- Systematic review of published implementation studies (2013-2015)
- n=111 studies



Based on Montrosse-Moorhead, Juskiewicz, Li, Rhoads, & Gambino (2016)

#### Core Components Criteria Model





Major proponents include Rossi (Chen, & Rossi, 1980; Rossi, Freeman, & Wright, 1979; Rossi, Lipsey, & Freeman, 2004) and Cordray (Cordray, 1986, 1989; Cordray, & Pion, 2006; Hulleman, & Cordray, 2009; Lipey, & Cordray, 2000; Nelson, Cordray, Hulleman, Darrow, & Sommer, 2012).

#### Core Components Example











### **Learning Objectives**



### Thank You

Bianca Montrosse-Moorhead Measurement, Evaluation, & Assessment Educational Psychology Department University of Connecticut bianca@uconn.edu